

Praeger Review: Effects on marine algae of changed seawater

chemistry with increasing atmospheric CO 2

J.A. Raven

Biology and Environment: Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy, Volume 111B, Number 1, May 2011, pp. 1-17 (Article)

Published by Royal Irish Academy



➡ For additional information about this article https://muse.jhu.edu/article/809643/summary



# EFFECTS ON MARINE ALGAE OF CHANGED SEAWATER CHEMISTRY WITH INCREASING ATMOSPHERIC CO<sub>2</sub>

# J.A. Raven

### ABSTRACT

The acid-base relations of plant (including algal) environments are complex, comprising geological processes as modified by biology including, especially over the last 200 years, man. Some habitats (e.g. high intertidal rockpools and some freshwater bodies) have pH variations of up to three units over a diel cycle as a result of photosynthesis and respiration. Other habitats, e.g. nutrient-poor open ocean habitats, have diel variations that are more than an order of magnitude smaller. Anthropogenic influences on acid-base relations of different habitats include the input to the atmosphere of gases that dissolve to produce acidic solutions. The quantitatively predominant gas is CO<sub>2</sub>, but SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub> and NH<sub>y</sub> (via nitrification) can also be significant. The influence of the acidic gases in aquatic habitats (including the upper layers of peat bogs) and on terrestrial photosynthetic organisms alters the inorganic carbon speciation and pH around the photosynthetic cells. The calcified coralline marine red macroalgae, with benthic and unattached (maerl) life forms, have extracellular calcification; their calcification rate will decline in the future, with a more CO2-rich ocean and decreasing CO32- concentrations. The marine planktonic coccolithophores have intracellular calcification, though the coccoliths themselves occur externally. While many coccolithophores show decreased calcification with increasing external CO<sub>2</sub> and the attendant decrease in external  $CO_3^{2-}$ , this is not universal. For both coralline red algae and coccolithophores the external CaCO3 will dissolve when seawater becomes undersaturated with respect to the relevant crystal form of CaCO<sub>3</sub>. Overall, the effects of increased CO<sub>2</sub> alone are negligible or result in increased growth of non-calcified algae, while there is most generally a decreased growth of calcified algae.

#### INTRODUCTION

The acid-base properties of the environment of plants and algae are complex and ecologically important. These acid-base properties are often encapsulated in the pH value, though this is just one outcome of often complex chemistry and biochemistry. Of particular interest is the inorganic carbon system, i.e. CO<sub>2</sub>-H<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub>-HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>-CaCO<sub>3</sub> with the associated H<sup>+</sup> and OH<sup>-</sup>, and the cycling of its components through the biosphere and the Earth's crust. This sort of cycling was first proposed by the 'father of geology', James Hutton (Hutton 1795; 1889). On an abiotic Earth, but with the present atmospheric composition, the main acid-base interaction would be the chemical weathering of silicates consuming H<sub>2</sub>O and atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, producing soluble cations, bicarbonate and silicic acid. These would reach the sea in rivers, and would ultimately be precipitated as CaCO<sub>3</sub> and Si(OH)<sub>4</sub>. After subduction, reverse weathering and vulcanism return

CO<sub>2</sub> to the atmosphere and silicate volcanic rocks to the land surface. Although the precipitation of CaCO<sub>3</sub> generates CO<sub>2</sub>, there is a net CO, removal from the atmosphere in the overall process of chemical weathering on land, and CaCO, precipitation in the ocean that is approximately balanced over the long term (many millions of years) by CO, output from vulcanism in the exogenic cycle (Garrels and Lerman 1981; Berner and Berner 1996). Biology on Earth increases the rate of chemical weathering by transfer of photosynthate into the upper layers of rock followed by production of CO, by respiration, so that the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration within the rock is higher than that at air equilibrium. Biota also catalyse the sedimentation of CaCO<sub>3</sub> and SiO<sub>2</sub> in the ocean, with photosynthetic organisms playing a leading role: diatoms dominate SiO, sedimentation and have decreased the surface ocean Si(OH), to well below saturation with respect to diatom opal, while coccolithophores are major contributors to sedimentation of CaCO<sub>3</sub>, although the present

J.A. Raven (j.a.raven@ dundee.ac.uk), Division of Plant Sciences, University of Dundee at JHRI, The James Hutton Institute, Invergowrie, Dundee DD2 5DA, UK, and School of Plant Biology, University of Western Australia, 35 Stirling Highway, Crawley, WA 6009, Australia.

Cite as follows: Raven, J.A. 2011 Effects on marine algae of changed seawater chemistry with increasing atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *Biology and Environment: Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy* **111**B, 1–17. DOI: 10.3318/ BIOE.2011.01

Received 17 February 2011. Accepted 15 March 2011. Published 5 May 2011. surface ocean is oversaturated with respect to coccolithophore calcite.

Some marine habitats, such as high intertidal rockpools, have pH variations of up to three units over a diel cycle as a result of photosynthesis and respiration (Poole and Raven 1997), and there are rather smaller variations in shallow-water macroalgal habitats with more exchange with bulk seawater (Middelboe and Hansen 2007). Other habitats, e.g. nutrient-poor open ocean habitats, have diel and seasonal variations that are more than an order of magnitude smaller (Dore *et al.* 2009).

Anthropogenic addition of CO<sub>2</sub> to the atmosphere is partly removed by net ecosystem productivity on land and by solution in the surface seawater, the rest remaining in the atmosphere. Solution of CO<sub>2</sub> in seawater alters the speciation of the dissolved inorganic carbon system (Table 1). The dissolved CO, hydrates to form hydrated CO<sub>2</sub> and some H<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub> (Adamczyk et al. 2009), which increases the concentration of these two molecular species (Table 1). The increased concentration of H<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub> dissociates to form HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and H<sup>+</sup>, while hydroxylation of hydrated CO, also forms HCO3-: both reactions increase the H<sup>+</sup>/ OH<sup>-</sup> and the concentration of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. Despite the increase in HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and in total dissolved inorganic carbon, the increased H<sup>+</sup> means that the ratio of  $HCO_3^{-}/CO_3^{2-}$  rises to an extent that corresponds to a decrease in the concentration of CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> (Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow 2001; Raven et al. 2005; Doney et al. 2009). This anthropogenic 'ocean acidification' has been mimicked in many experiments in order to determine its effect on photosynthetic and non-photosynthetic organisms (Hurd et al. 2009; Shi et al. 2009; Riebesell et al. 2010). Given the prevailing Ca<sup>2+</sup> concentration, the  $CO_3^{2-}$  concentration in surface seawater is still saturated with respect to calcite, though

aragonite is undersaturated in parts of the Arctic Ocean as a result of increased fresh (melt) water inputs (Chierichi and Fransson 2009; Yamamoto et al. 2009). The effects of the changes in ocean chemistry attendant on anthropogenic increases in CO<sub>2</sub> have been subject to a several reviews: recent meta-analyses have been published by Hendriks et al. (2010) (see also Dupont et al. (2010) and Hendriks and Duarte (2010)) and by Kroeker et al. (2010). It must be borne in mind, however, that the statistical analysis component of meta-analyses needs very careful attention (e.g. Gurevitch and Hedges 1999; Hedges et al. 1999). What is unequivocal is that there are significantly different effects for different processes and groups of organisms, and the results reported here are robust.

Increasing atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> also influences inland waters, with consequent decreases in pH, although small or enclosed water bodies may become supersaturated with CO<sub>2</sub> as a result of input of ground water containing organic and inorganic carbon due to terrestrial photosynthesis in the catchment (Maberly 1996). Such water bodies will presumably be less influenced by increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> than large inland water bodies and the open ocean.

Other atmospheric anthropogenic inputs— NO<sub>x</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub> and SO<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (Fowler *et al.* 2007)—can cause localised increases in H<sup>+</sup>/ OH<sup>-</sup> in the surface ocean (Doney *et al.* 2007). These compounds are produced naturally, by lightning (NO<sub>x</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub>) and oxidation of biogenic dimethylsulphide (SO<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>). Their anthropogenic production comes from hightemperature combustion (NO<sub>x</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub>) and from sulphur in coal and some ship fuels (SO<sub>2</sub>/ H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>) (Fowler *et al.* 2007). When these compounds, by dry or wet deposition, enter surface seawater they are, or can form, the strong acids

Table 1—Changes in surface ocean inorganic carbon chemistry at four atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> mol fractions, assuming equilibrium with the atmosphere and a total alkalinity 2324µmol kg<sup>-1</sup> at a temperature of 18°C. Adapted from Raven *et al.* (2005) and Adamczyk *et al.* (2009).

	Pre-industrial	Present	$2 \times pre-industrial$	$3 \times pre-industrial$
Atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub> *	280	380	560	840
Surface ocean CO <sub>2</sub> <sup>†</sup>	9	13	19	28
Surface ocean H <sub>2</sub> CO <sup>†</sup>				
Surface ocean HCO, <sup>†</sup>	1766	1876	1976	2070
Surface ocean CO <sup>2-†</sup>	225	185	141	103
Surface ocean total dissolved inorganic carbon	2003	2065	2136	2133
Surface ocean pH	8.18	8.07	7.92	7.77

HNO<sub>3</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>. The essentially complete dissociation of these acids resembles the addition of a strong acid (HCl) in many experiments to determine the effects of ocean acidification on photosynthetic (and other) organisms (Hurd et al. 2009; Shi et al. 2009; Riebesell et al. 2010). This differs from the method involving CO<sub>2</sub> addition because there is no increase in total inorganic carbon in the system, so that  $HCO_3^-$  decreases rather than increases as CO, increases. Doney et al. (2007) show that the effect of these strong acids on the ocean H<sup>+</sup>/OH<sup>-</sup> are small relative to those of anthropogenic  $CO_2$ : the effects are also more localised because production of those compounds is, like that of CO<sub>2</sub>, localised, but the strong acids and their precursors have much shorter atmospheric lifetimes than does CO<sub>2</sub>. The strong acid, HNO<sub>3</sub>, is also a result of nitrification of NH<sub>v</sub> that, in the form of NH<sub>3</sub>, is a weak base. Atmospheric NH, is produced naturally from wildfire and decomposition of animal faeces and urine on land, and can be produced anthropogenically by low-temperature combustion of coal. Intensive animal production is also a significant source of NH<sub>v</sub>, as is land-spreading of slurry and related waste products (Hyde et al. 2003; DEFRA 2005). The extent of surface ocean acidification from this source is limited by the short atmospheric lifetime of NH,, the photoinhibition of nitrification, and the decreased nitrification in an ocean at lower pH (Beman et al. 2011). The deposition of combined nitrogen from the atmosphere into the surface ocean, and especially parts of the coastal ocean, is more important to algae nutritionally than with respect to ocean acid-base relations (Paerl 1997; Doney et al. 2007). The prevailing wind direction relative to sources of atmospheric combined nitrogen means that the coastal waters of Ireland, and especially western Ireland, are less influenced by such nitrogen inputs than are some other coastal waters, e.g. the North Sea (Paerl 1997). The very high sulphate concentration in seawater means that sulphur inputs to seawater are nutritionally insignificant for algae.

An influence of inputs of strong acid input from the atmosphere similar to that found in seawater is found in inland waters, including mires, and in soils that have acid-base buffering that is of a similar magnitude to, or higher than, that of seawater (Maberly 1996). By contrast, soils and inland waters with a low acid-base buffering have their H<sup>+</sup>/OH<sup>-</sup> relations significantly influenced by atmospheric inputs of strong acids (Fowler *et al.* 2007; Battarbee 2010). There are direct influences of the nitrogen and sulphur inputs to ecosystems (e.g. Fowler *et al.* 2007; Jones et al. 2007a; 2007b; Giordano et al. 2008), but the acid-base impact is also significant.

# INFLUENCE OF ANTHROPOGENIC CARBON DIOXIDE ON PHOTOSYNTHESIS AND GROWTH BY MARINE ALGAE

The increasing atmospheric CO, has variable effects on the photosynthesis and growth of marine algae. Almost all marine phytoplankton organisms have CO2-concentrating mechanisms (CCMs) and have a higher affinity for inorganic carbon than would be expected for an otherwise similar organism with diffusive CO<sub>2</sub> entry (Giordano et al. 2005; Raven 2010; 2011; Raven et al. 2011; Reinfelder 2011). Some organisms with CCMs, e.g. many cyanobacteria, might have difficulties with growing in the absence of a CCM: while they have the capacity to recycle phosphoglycolate to sugars and have a high CO<sub>2</sub> permeability, they do not have a ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase with high enough CO<sub>2</sub> affinity and CO<sub>2</sub>/O<sub>2</sub> selectivity to permit net CO, assimilation over the diel cycle (Giordano et al. 2005; Raven 2010; 2011; Raven et al. 2011; Reinfelder 2011).

Many genotypes of phytoplankton with CCMs are saturated for growth and photosynthesis under current dissolved inorganic carbon concentrations, although a significant number show an increased rate of photosynthesis and growth when grown with additional CO2. (Giordano et al. 2005; Iglesias-Rodriguez et al. 2008a; Hurd et al. 2009; Berge et al. 2010; Neilsen et al. 2010; Raven 2010; 2011; Raven et al. 2011; Reinfelder 2011; Tyrrell 2011). These results, however, relate only to an increase in CO<sub>2</sub> as the only variable in cultures that are saturated with respect to other resources. Variations in the availability of other resources (photosynthetically active radiation, nitrogen, phosphorus and iron) and damaging UVB radiation have varying effects on the growth and photosynthesis of algal cultures when tested one at a time with varying inorganic carbon availability (Giordano et al. 2005; Raven 2010; 2011; Raven et al. 2011). The relevance of these studies on other environmental factors that interact with the effects of increased CO, to models of future CO<sub>2</sub> levels is that in the resulting warmer ocean, shoaling of the upper mixed layer will occur alongside changes in availability of nutrients and in mean photon flux densities of photosynthetically active radiation and ultraviolet B (Steinacher et al. 2010). In analyses that do not

include a CO<sub>2</sub> increase, phytoplankton growth is predicted to increased at high latitudes as a result of decreased mixing depth, which decreases light limitation of growth without substantially reducing nutrient supply (Steinacher et al. 2010). At mid- and low latitudes, although the already high mean irradiance is increased, the decreased nutrient supply dominates the effect on primary productivity, which is decreased (Steinacher et al. 2010). Boyce et al. (2010) suggest that a significant decrease in marine planktonic primary productivity has already occurred over the last century as a result of this shoaling. Further complications are added by the effects of increased atmospheric CO, in decreasing the rate of nitrification (Beman et al. 2011) and altering iron speciation (Breitbarth et al. 2010; Shi et al. 2010). These observations and analyses suggest that the major effect of atmospheric CO, increase on marine phytoplankton productivity will be mainly indirect, through warming and hence shoaling of the upper mixed layer with changes in the supply of resources, of which inorganic carbon is not a major determinant.

Benthic marine macroalgae are limited to coastal waters with a maximum depth of less than 300m (Littler et al. 1985; Raven et al. 2000). While a majority of species of benthic macroalgae have CCMs, there are a significant number, albeit a minority of organisms dependent on diffusive CO, entry (Maberly 1990; Johnston et al. 1992; Maberly et al. 1992; Kübler et al. 1999; Raven et al. 2002a; 2002b; 2005; Giordano et al. 2005; Kevekordes et al. 2006; Raven 2010). The organisms with CO<sub>2</sub> diffusion are generally found in subtidal or other shaded habitats, i.e. habitats where photosynthetically active radiation rather than inorganic carbon is more likely to be growth-limiting (Raven et al. 2002a; 2002b; 2005; Raven 2010). However, some algae lacking CCMs occur in the intralittoral fringe, e.g. Bostrychia scorpioides in Ireland on muddy shores and on salt marsh plants (Raven et al. 2002a; 2002b; 2005; Raven 2010). Here nutrients other than inorganic carbon are only available during the brief periods of submersion at high tide; inorganic carbon is available as atmospheric CO, during atmospheric exposure as long as the organisms stay hydrated, while atmospheric supply of other nutrients is generally very small. For these algae, nutrients other than carbon are likely to be limiting for growth. The occurrence of inorganic carbon entry by CO, diffusion in benthic macroalgae can thus be rationalised, although further evidence is needed, and it must be remembered that there are also macroalgae with CCMs in all of the habitats in which macroalgae relying on

CO<sub>2</sub> diffusion occur (Raven 2002a; 2002b). An extreme example is the deepest known marine benthic macroalga, a coralline red alga from a seamount off the Bahamas, where the photosynthetically active radiation input is little more than that found at the ocean surface at night under a full moon (Littler et al. 1985; Raven et al. 2000; Raven and Cockell 2006). While there is no direct evidence on the occurrence of a CCM in this alga, coralline red algae (like other calcified macroalgae) have CCMs. An example found in Ireland is the ornithocoprophilous Prasiola stipitata in the infralittoral fringe of rocky shores (Raven and Johnston 1991), where the reduced availability of nutrients other than inorganic carbon from atmospheric CO, during emersion is offset by the nutrients in bird excreta and faeces.

In the context of anthropogenic  $CO_2$  inputs to the ocean, it is expected that benthic algae lacking CCMs will be favoured. The situation is complicated by the predicted decrease in nutrient availability with shoaling of the upper mixed layer and its effects on inorganic carbon assimilation by  $CO_2$  diffusion or by CCMs, although the influence on light availability to phytoplankton of this shoaling is not seen for the benthic algae (Raven *et al.* 2011). Thus the influence of environmental change on the acquisition of inorganic carbon in marine benthic macroalga differs from that in phytoplankton, with further complications due to localised nutrient inputs from rivers and the atmosphere.

## CALCIFICATION BY MARINE BENTHIC MACROALGAE

Calcified red, green and, to a smaller extent, brown seaweeds are common in warmer marine waters. Ireland has no calcified green marine algae, and Padina pavonica is the only calcified brown alga. By contrast, there are a number of calcified red algae (Rhodophyta: Floridiophyceae) on the Irish coast (Table 2). Examples of these coralline algae, with taxa found in Ireland, are the erect articulate Corallina officinalis, which also has a crustose phase, and the crustose Lithophyllum and Lithothamnion, which occur on rocks (Lithophyllum and Lithothamnion) and free-living as rhodoliths (maerl)-mainly Phymatolithon with some Lithothamnion (Bosence 1976; Irvine and Chamberlain 1994; de Grave and Whitaker 1999; Blake and Maggs 2003; Wilson et al. 2004; Francis et al. 2010). The attached forms are haptophytes in the terminology of Luther (1947), while the unattached maerl forms are pleustophytes (Luther 1947) (Table 2).

Property	Coralline red algae	Coccolithophores	
Size	Macroalga	Microalga; most are nanophyto- plankton (2–20µm diameter)	
Life form	Haptophytic encrusting and/or erect Pleustophytic (rhodoliths/maerl)	Planktophytes; some have benthic phases in the lifecycle	
Site of CaCO <sub>3</sub> deposition Final location of CaCO <sub>3</sub>	Extracellular Extracellular	Intracellular Extracellular	

Table 2—Comparison of coralline red algae and coccolithophores.

Although the earliest known fossil red alga is that of the non-calcified bangiophycean Bangiomorpha pubescens from deposits more than 1.2 billion years old (Butterfield 2000), the earliest known coralline red is from the Cambrian (542-488 million years ago). There is a good fossil record of coralline red alga through the Phanerozoic, and the evolution of crustose coralline red algae can be related to herbivory (Steneck 1983; 1986). These algae can live for years to decades or centuries (Bosence 1976; Steneck 1983; 1986; Littler et al. 1991; de Grave and Whitaker 1999; Blake and Maggs 2003; Bosence and Wilson 2003; Wilson et al. 2004; Mantone 2010). Maerl deposits are under threat from mining, for example for use in agriculture, although the analyses that are available do not show any additional value in maerl that is not also found in limestone (Blunden et al. 1997). The global annual CaCO<sub>3</sub> deposition in the coastal zone is some 23Tmol carbon; it is not clear how much of this is contributed by maerl (Gattuso et al. 1998).

CaCO<sub>3</sub> as calcite is sedimented in intercellular spaces in coralline red algae according to the generalised equation  $Ca^{2+} + 2HCO_3^{-} = CaCO_3 +$ CO<sub>2</sub> + H<sub>2</sub>O. Lack of spontaneous CaCO<sub>3</sub> deposition in the present surface seawater, despite supersaturation with respect to calcite (and aragonite) means that one or more of removal of inhibitors of nucleation and crystal growth, and facilitation of nucleation and crystal growth using organic templates, must be missing globally (Davis et al. 2000). The coralline red algae have CCMs (Blinks 1963; Borowitzka 1981; Gao et al. 1993), which means that localised pH increases can occur beyond pH 9.0 in intercellular spaces and on the surface of the organism, facilitating CaCO<sub>3</sub> sedimentation in the light. The calcification rate is greater in the light than the dark (Borowitzka 1981; Gao et al. 1993). The calcification rate is proportional to the CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> concentration in the dark, but there is an additional 'vital effect' via photosynthesis, when the algae are illuminated presumably as a result of the net

removal of (effectively)  $CO_2$ , with the associated decrease in  $CO_3^{2-}$  and increased pH in and near the cell walls (Borowitzka 1981). In the dark there is sometimes a net loss of  $CaCO_3$ , presumably as a result of  $CO_2$  production in respiration with the corresponding decrease in  $CO_3^{2-}$  and pH in and near the cell wall (Chisholm 2000). Despite the evidence of a 'vital effect' on the rate of crystallisation, the Mg:Ca ratio in calcite sedimented by coralline algae follows the Mg and Ca content in the seawater they grew in (Stanley *et al.* 2002; Ries 2006).

With the CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations expected in 2100 the rate of calcification and the growth rate of coralline algae have been shown to decrease in laboratory cultures (Gao et al. 1993; Doney et al. 2009; Ries et al. 2009; Semesi et al. 2009; Hofmann et al. 2010; Tyrrell 2011). Longerterm experiments (seven weeks) in mesocosms based on natural seawater showed a decrease in growth and recruitment of crustose coralline algae (Kuffner et al. 2008). Similar conclusions can be drawn from field observations at marine CO, vents at Ischia in the Mediterranean (Hall-Spencer et al. 2008). Here the distance of biota from the vent determines the mean CO<sub>2</sub> concentration to which they are exposed. The seagrass Posidonia showed the greatest biomass at the lowest pH (7.6) examined, while the biomass of coralline algae is greatly decreased. A pH of 7.6 is well below what corresponds to the atmospheric CO, concentration expected in 2100, so the results of Hall-Spencer et al. (2008) show that some coralline algae can survive at CO, concentrations corresponding to pH values 1.5 units below the present level. Although the vents have a short life (decades) in evolutionary terms for coralline algae, which can live for years, and even decades or centuries (Blake and Maggs 2003; Wilson et al. 2004; Marbà et al. 2007; Francis et al. 2010), the possibility of genotypic adaptation of the coralline algae to increased CO2 at vents should be investigated. It is important to realise that, while the vents have increased CO<sub>2</sub>, mimicking what will happen decades hence, they are not subject to the

predicted changes in the availability of nitrogen and phosphorus (see Steinacher et al. 2010).

Regardless of the effects on the rate of calcification as a function of decreasing external  $CO_3^{2-}$  concentration as CO<sub>2</sub> increases, calcite dissolved in surface seawater is undersaturated with respect to the relevant (high-Mg or low-Mg) calcite form. The rate of dissolution is proportional to the degree of undersaturation. The 'vital effects' of photosynthesis and respiration will decrease the rate of dissolution in the light, and increase the rate in the dark (Borowitzka 1981; Chisholm 2000). This dissolution will be more significant for the coralline red algae than for the coccolithophores (see below) because of the smaller mean lifetime of coccolithophores than of the coralline red algae under natural conditions (Bosence 1976; Steneck 1983; 1986; Littler et al. 1991; de Grave and Whitaker 1999; Blake and Maggs 2003; Bosence and Wilson 2003; Marbà et al. 2007; Mantone 2010).

# CALCIFICATION BY COCCOLITHOPHORES

Coccolithophores are calcified phytoplankton algae (planktophytes in the terminology of Luther 1947): some have a benthic phase in the life cycle (Green and Leadbeater 1994; Thierstein and Young 2004) (Table 2). The coccolithophores are members of the class Prymnesiophyceae in the phylum Haptophyta of the kingdom Chromista (Green and Leadbeater 1994; Thierstein and Young 2004). The calcitic coccoliths that the algae produce are major contributors to marine pelagic CaCO, precipitation: they are responsible for at least half of the annual CaCO<sub>3</sub> deposition of about 110Tmol carbon per year, the rest being attributed to foraminiferans (Balch et al. 2007; Broecker and Clark 2009). In comparison, annual production of only 30Tmol carbon per year has been cited for the marine pelagial (Gattuso et al. 1998). Poulton et al. (2007) suggested that the production of global organic carbon due to coccolithophores is similar to their production of particulate inorganic carbon. Other members of this phylum (some of the Prymnesiophyceae and all of the Pavlovophyceae) are non-calcified (Green and Leadbeater 1994; Thierstein and Young 2004). The non-calcified picoplanktonic and small nanoplanktonic haptophytes are significant contributors to global marine primary productivity (Liu et al. 2009; Cuvellier et al. 2010; Jardiller et al. 2010; Uitz et al. 2010). Coccolithophores, and especially Emiliania huxleyi, form blooms in temperate waters, including

those near Ireland: the blooms can be readily imaged by satellites as a result of light scattering from attached and detached coccoliths (Harris 1994; Thierstein and Young 2004; Tyrrell and Merico 2004; O'Boyle and Silke 2010).

Calcite formation in coccolithophores occurs inside the cells in coccolith-forming vesicles (Green and Leadbeater 1994; Thierstein and Young 2004; Mackinder et al. 2010) (Table 2). This gives the organism more control over the environment in which calcification occurs. While coccoliths generally have low-Mg calcite in the present ocean with its high Mg/Ca ratio, the lower Mg/Ca of Cretaceous seawater does not change the Mg/Ca of species with low-Mg calcite, but decreases the Mg content of calcite in those forms that today have high-Mg calcite (Stanley et al. 2005). These data show that the control over Mg/Ca in coccoliths is not uniform across coccolithophores, despite calcification being intracellular. The completed coccoliths are then exocytosed (Green and Leadbeater 1994; Thierstein and Young 2004; Mackinder et al. 2010) (Table 2). The functions of coccoliths in the ecology of coccolithophores have been much debated (Sikes and Wilbur 1982; Green and Leadbeater 1994; Young 1994; Raven and Waite 2004; Harris et al. 2005; Guan and Gao 2010a; 2010b). It is likely that there are multiple functions that can be acted on by natural selection, increasing the difficulty of modelling the influence of variations in the extent of calcification with environmental change (Irie et al. 2010). In addition to the effects of calcification on the ecophysiology of living coccolithophores, there can be post-mortem (emergent) properties of coccospheres and coccoliths that may act as ballast on organic particles and increase the rate of sinking (Engel et al. 2009a; 2009b; Bierman and Engel 2010).

The overall equation for calcite precipitation with dissolved substrates from seawater by coccolithophores can be approximated by  $Ca^{2+} + 2HCO_3^- = CaCO_3 + CO_2 + H_2O$ , just as for the extracellular calcification by the coralline red algae. However, this refers to the reaction observed in the bulk seawater in which the coccolithophores are growing. As will be seen, what happens inside the cells where calcification occurs depends on the species of inorganic carbon entering the cells and the degree of coupling between calcification and photosynthesis.

There are still several unsolved questions about the mechanism of transport of the components of coccolithophore calcification from the medium to the lumen of the coccolith-forming vesicle. Raven (1980) pointed out that the very low free  $Ca^{2+}$  concentration in the eukaryote cytosol caused problems for supply of Ca at the rate required for the rate of coccolith formation if the flux was by Ca diffusion through the cytosol from the plasmalemma to the coccolith-forming vesicles. This question has not yet been resolved (Mackinder *et al.* 2010).

The inorganic carbon component used to produce the calcite crosses the plasmalemma as  $HCO_3^-$ . Sikes et al. (1980), for instance, used the isotope disequilibrium technique and showed that HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> rather than CO, was the inorganic carbon species entering the cell. While such results are usually interpreted as showing  $HCO_3^{-1}$  influx, the technique is based on the slow equilibration between CO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub>, HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and  $CO_3^{2-}$ : the equilibration among the latter three molecular species is too rapid to be captured by the technique (Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow 2001). The other technique used is based on studying calcification rates in multifactorial experiments with changed pH and inorganic carbon concentration (Paasche 1964; Buitenhuis et al. 1999). Plots of the rate of calcification as a function of the concentration of one of CO2, HCO3 and CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> show that the rate-HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> relationship is the one that agrees with a saturating, rectangular hyperbola-like, relationship expected for a transporter (Paasche 1964; Buitenhuis et al. 1999).

It is clear from the work of Paasche (1964) and Buitenhuis et al. (1999), as well as from measurements of calcification as a function of inorganic carbon concentration by other workers using 'normal' seawater pH, that calcification occurs even when calcite is undersaturated in the medium, so that coccolith formation in coccolith-forming vesicles continues even when the externalised coccoliths are in a medium leading to net dissolution of calcite. While Paasche (1964) found that the relationship between calcification and the external inorganic carbon concentration showed a near-zero intercept on both axes, i.e. zero calcification rate at zero inorganic carbon, Buitenhuis et al. (1999) found that calcification did not occur below a certain finite concentration of total inorganic C (0.5mol m<sup>-3</sup>).

The significance of the influx of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> rather than of CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> when the intracellular precipitation of calcite consumes CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> is one related to acid-base and charge balance. Based on Ca<sup>2+</sup> and HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> entry, intracellular calcification can be represented as Ca<sup>2+</sup> + HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>  $\rightarrow$  CaCO<sub>3</sub> + H<sup>+</sup>. There is the possibility of consumption of the excess H<sup>+</sup> in photosynthesis if HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is the form of inorganic carbon entering the cells via CO<sub>2</sub> production from H<sup>+</sup> and HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, since CO<sub>2</sub> is the species of inorganic carbon consumed

by RuBisCO, assuming a 1:1 stoichiometry of carbon use in calcite production and in photosynthesis, as follows:  $Ca^{2+} + 2HCO_3^{-} + >8$  photons  $\rightarrow$  CaCO<sub>3</sub> + (CH<sub>2</sub>O) + O<sub>2</sub>. This cannot be the whole story, as there is growing evidence that the CO<sub>2</sub> generated during intracellular calcification in coccolithophores is not stoichiometrically consumed in photosynthesis, or otherwise necessarily involved in supplying CO, to Rubisco, including (in some cases) calcification continuing in the dark (Paasche 1964; 1965; 1966a; 1966b; 2001; Balch et al. 1992; 1996; Fernández et al. 1993; Herfort et al. 2004; Trimborn et al. 2007; Leonardos et al. 2009; Barcelos e Ramos 2010). When less H<sup>+</sup> is consumed in photosynthesis than produced in calcification there is (i) a need to remove H<sup>+</sup> from the cell to the medium if acid-base and charge balance are to be maintained when the rate of carbon incorporation in calcification exceeds that in photosynthesis (Sikes et al. 1980), and (ii) for H<sup>+</sup> to enter when the rate of carbon assimilation in photosynthesis exceeds that in calcification. The limiting case for photosynthesis exceeding calcification is zero calcification, bringing non-calcifying coccolithophores into the same category with respect to acid-base balance and charge balance as other phytoplankton with a CCM based on HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> entry with a 1:1 stoichiometry of H<sup>+</sup> influx or OH<sup>-</sup> efflux. It is important to remember that the overall reaction in seawater in the light is, for a given stoichiometry of photosynthesis and calcification, independent of the degree of intracellular coupling of photosynthesis and calcification.

A further point about acid-base regulation is that the uptake and reductive assimilation of  $NO_3^{-}$  and  $SO_4^{2-}$  generate  $OH^{-}$  in excess of what is required in intracellular acid-base balance, and OH<sup>-</sup> is lost from the cell (equivalent to H<sup>+</sup> uptake) (Raven and Smith 1974; 1976; Smith and Raven 1979; Goldman and Brewer 1980; Raven and Farquhar 1990; Raven 1993). Raven (1993) suggested that the high concentration of the compatible solute dimethylsulphoniopropionate in coccolithophores would increase the cellular sulphur quota and thus the OH<sup>-</sup> efflux, but the measured sulphur content of the two coccolithophores examined is lower than that of the mean sulphur content of the fifteen marine phytoplankton species examined by Ho et al. (2003). When the nitrogen sources is  $NH_4^+$  the net effect of nitrogen and sulphur assimilation on intracellular acid-base balance is an excess of H<sup>+</sup>, which is excreted (Raven and Smith 1974; 1976; Smith and Raven 1979; Goldman and Brewer 1980). The use of organic nitrogen (urea, amino acids) gives acid-base perturbations within the range

known for  $NH_4^+$  for  $NO_3^-$  (Raven and Smith 1974; 1976; Smith and Raven 1979). Beman *et al.* (2011) suggest that nitrification could be inhibited in higher  $CO_2$  concentrations, so reduced forms of nitrogen may become more important relative to  $NO_3^-$  under these conditions.

Imbalance of acid-base relations in the cytosol of cells is indicated by changes in the cytosolic pH, while charge imbalance is indicated by changes in the electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma. Walker (1976, 47-48) elegantly shows that the values of the membrane capacitance (relating potential difference to charge imbalance across a given area of membrane) and of the cytosol H<sup>+</sup> buffer capacity (relating H<sup>+</sup> addition or removal to the pH of a given volume) are such, when related to the cytosol volume per unit area of plasmalemma that a (notional) given rate of addition of H<sup>+</sup> to the cytosol takes the electrical potential difference outside the tolerable range much more quickly than it changes the pH to an intolerable value. What are these intolerable values? Measurement of the pH of the intracellular compartments of plant cells is difficult (Small 1946; 1954; 1955; Raven and Smith 1974; 1976; Smith and Raven 1979), and there are also problems with measuring the electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma in small cells such as those of most coccolithophores (Raven and Smith 1974; 1976; Smith and Raven 1979). There are many estimates of the potential difference across the plasmalemma of marine algae, these are mainly for large cells (Raven 1976), though there are estimates for coccolithophores (Sikes and Wilbur 1982; Anning et al. 1996). There have been relatively few estimates of the pH of the cytosol of marine algal cells since the early work of Raven and Smith (1980), though there are values for coccolithophores (Anning et al. 1996). It is known from work on marine and other photosynthetic organisms that the pH of the cytosol can only vary by about 0.5 units and the electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma can only vary by about 0.2 V (Raven and Smith 1974; 1976; Smith and Raven 1979). Within the tolerable cytosolic pH range there is typically a 0.1 unit decrease in cytosolic pH with each unit decrease in external pH, and vice versa for an external pH increase (Smith and Raven 1979). In the context of calcification in coccolithophores, such a scaling factor of 0.1 between internal and external pH would mean that the cytosolic CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> concentration only decreases by ~10% of the decrease in external  $CO_3^{2-}$  concentration with a given decrease in external pH.

The means by which  $H^+$  moves across the plasmalemma of coccolithophores is not yet clear.

An interesting possibility for those cells with very small electrochemical potential differences across the plasmalemma (Anning et al. 1996) is the voltage-gated H<sup>+</sup> channel predicted from genomic analysis (Mackinder et al. 2010), and now functionally demonstrated by Suffrian et al. (2011) and Taylor et al. (2011). While such a transport mechanism is passive, i.e. no exergonic reaction is stoichiometrically coupled to the transport of H<sup>+</sup> through the transporter protein, energy must be applied to the movement of other ions in maintaining the electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma that results in an inward- or outward-directed H<sup>+</sup> gradient. A more direct application of metabolic energy occurs if the flux of H<sup>+</sup> occurs against the H<sup>+</sup> free energy gradient. The overall energy requirement for calcification in seawater in equilibrium with the present atmosphere was estimated by Anning et al. (1996) to be 30% of that required to assimilate an equal quantity of inorganic carbon in photosynthesis.

For the less likely option of  $CO_2^{2-}$  entry (Paasche 1964; Sikes et al. 1980; Buitenhuis et al. 1999), the pH of the cytosol of coccolithophores ranges from at least one, and sometimes more than two, units lower than the pK<sub>12</sub> of the inorganic carbon system at the ionic strength of the cytosol, so that the equilibrium concentration of  $CO_3^{2-}$  is always less than 10% of the total inorganic carbon in the cytosol (Anning et al. 1996). The very high rate constants for the interconversion of HCO, and CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> mean that the equilibrium is reached more rapidly than either species can diffuse from the plasmalemma to the coccolith-forming vesicle (or the plastids). The reasoning here is that the half-time of equilibration of the two ionised inorganic carbon species under cytosolic conditions is about 10<sup>-7</sup>s (Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow (2001, 104-105, 109-110)), while the half-time for diffusive equilibration of either ionised inorganic carbon species over an assumed 1µm of cytosol between the plasmalemma and the coccolith-forming vesicle is of the order of 10<sup>-4</sup>s (Nobel 2005, 19). If  $CO_3^{2-}$  was the species taken up by coccolith-forming vesicles, there would be no H<sup>+</sup> production during calcification, so that there would be no production of CO<sub>2</sub> from  $HCO_3^-$  using H<sup>+</sup> from calcification as required by hypotheses that envisage an internal mechanistic link between photosynthesis and calcification. Similarly, there would be no need for H<sup>+</sup> excretion from cells during coccolithogenesis as is the case with HCO3<sup>-</sup> entry if there is no mechanistic link between the supply of inorganic carbon substrates for photosynthesis and for coccolithogenesis. The only H<sup>+</sup> cycling needed in relation to coccolithogenesis when  $CO_3^{2-}$  enters the cells

is that of (i) buffered H<sup>+</sup> in the cytosol from the coccolith vesicle back to the plasmalemma in charge and (ii) pH balance if HCO3<sup>-</sup> is the main inorganic carbon species diffusing through the cytosol, as would be expected in view of its dominance in terms of concentration. For photosynthesis, CO32- entry to the cytosol would double the need for mechanisms (H<sup>+</sup> influx or OH<sup>-</sup> efflux) dealing with acid-base and charge balance attendant on entry of an ionised inorganic carbon species and the consumption of CO, that are seen when HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> enters the cell. As for intracellular calcification, the evidence does not favour  $CO_3^{2-}$  as the inorganic carbon species entering the cells for photosynthesis in with coccolithophores (Paasche 1964; Sikes et al. 1980; Buitenhuis et al. 1999) or other cells with CCMs (Maberly 1992).

Turning to the impact of anthropogenic CO, inputs on calcification by coccolithophores, there has been a wide range of reported effects that had been attributed to differences in experimental methods and genetic variations among the coccolithophores, or to both effects (Iglesias-Rodriguez et al. 2008a; 2008b; Riebesell et al. 2008; Doney et al. 2009; Hurd et al. 2009; Ridgwell et al. 2009; Schulz et al. 2009; Hofmann et al. 2010; Barcelos e Ramos et al. 2010; Müller et al. 2010). Only recently has it been shown that, using the same techniques in all cases, there are significant interspecific (Langer et al. 2006) and intraspecific (Langer et al. 2009) variations in the response among coccolithophores, and that the use of different techniques results in only small differences between calcification as a function of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in a single coccolithophore strain (Shi et al. 2009) and the length of time for which the cells are cultured at the experimental CO, concentrations (Barcelos e Ramos 2010; Müller et al. 2010). The outcome of this large body of work is that there are many genotypes for which the 'expected' decrease in calcification rate with increased CO<sub>2</sub> occurs, but there are some strains for which there is an increase and yet others for which there is some intermediate response.

Based on the frequently observed decrease in calcification with increasing CO<sub>2</sub> (Ridgwell *et al.* 2009), it has been suggested that there is a greater energy cost for coccolith formation in seawater equilibrated with higher than current atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (e.g. Raven *et al.* 2005; Irie *et al.* 2010). Considering first the more likely case of the entry of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, the mechanism of such an increased cost presumably does not involve HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> influx alone since there is a slight increase in external HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> with increased CO<sub>2</sub>. If coccolithophores have a scaling factor of 0.1 between cytosolic and external pH

similar to that found for other organisms (Smith and Raven 1979), the cytosolic CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> concentration would only decrease by 10% of the decrease in external CO32<sup>-</sup> concentration with a given decrease in external pH. Regulation of cytosolic pH with this scaling factor involves a larger minimum energy input as external pH decreases, since the driving force for downhill H<sup>+</sup> entry is greater, provided the electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma is constant. Any increased energy cost for calcification in higher CO<sub>2</sub> environments would then have a significant H<sup>+</sup> transport component related to the efflux of H<sup>+</sup> from calcification, provided that the H<sup>+</sup> had not been used in converting HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> to CO<sub>2</sub> in photosynthesis.

Before going further it is necessary to point out the constraints on an energetic comparison of cells grown under different conditions, e.g. today's CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and the CO<sub>2</sub> expected in 2100 CE. One point is that there is not necessarily a linear relationship between the energetic driving force for a reversible biological transmembrane transport (or biochemical, or mechanical) process, or an essentially irreversible process, and the net rate of the process. While the rate of the forward and the back reactions can be linearly related to the driving force for reversible reactions (Odum and Pinkerton 1955; Katchalsky and Curran 1965; Beard and Qian 2007), there are many biological situations that complicate such analyses (e.g. Michaelis-Menten kinetics (Beard and Qian 2007)) and variations in the catalytic capacity of the protein involved in catalysis (e.g. from post-translational modification and other kinds of regulation of the protein) or variations in expression of the protein, between organisms grown under (for example) present-day and 2100 CE CO<sub>2</sub>. There is also the question of when a reversible reaction that is far from thermodynamic equilibrium can be regarded as irreversible (Odum and Pinkerton 1955; Katchalsky and Curran 1965). Thus, even if the energetic stoichiometry of energy input (e.g. mol ATP converted to ADP and phosphate) and mol solute transported is unchanged, there may be other energy costs (e.g. increased expression of transporters in one growth condition relative to the other).

Based on the Nernst Equation, for a fixed number of  $H^+$  channels to be involved in removing excess  $H^+$ , a smaller value of the inside-negative electrical potential difference is needed to maintain the outwardly directed net driving force on  $H^+$ . Maintenance of such a change in the potential difference would ultimately be dependent on metabolic energy, and the decreased electrical potential difference would mean a smaller

driving force for any electrically driven nutrient co-transport systems, e.g. those coupled to Na<sup>+</sup> entry down a free energy gradient. An alternative mechanism for H<sup>+</sup> efflux would be active efflux. For this to be required there would, for a given cytosol pH, have to be a more inside-negative electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma, giving an inwardly directed driving force on H<sup>+</sup> greater than the energy requirement per H<sup>+</sup> moved out of the cytosol. Much more experimentation is needed to examine the qualitative and quantitative plausibility of these suggestions. Making the assumption that there is an increased energy cost of calcification in higher CO, environment, the evolutionary model of Irie et al. (2010) suggests that the optimal growth strategy is to grow more slowly but with greater calcification in a higher-CO, environment. Irie et al. (2010) point out the evidence for increased calcification of coccolithophores in the fossil record over the latest 200 years of marine sediments in Iglesias-Rodriguez et al. (2008a). However, although Iglesias-Rodriguez et al. (2008a), like some other workers (see Langer et al. 2009; Ridgwell et al. 2009), found increased calcification with increased CO<sub>2</sub>, they also found faster rather than slower growth at higher CO<sub>2</sub>.

The only experimental evidence on the energy cost of acid-base regulation in algae is for aciophilic green algae growing in inland waters (Messerli et al. 2005; Langner et al. 2008; Bethman and Schönknecht 2009). Here a major energy requirement seems to be for a large energised H<sup>+</sup> efflux against a substantial free energy difference related to the maintenance of a near-neutral cytosolic pH without a completely compensating change in the electrical potential difference across the plasmalemma. The active H<sup>+</sup> efflux removes H<sup>+</sup> that had leaked into the cells down the large H<sup>+</sup> free energy difference across the plasmalemma (Messerli et al. 2005; Langner et al. 2008; Bethman and Schönknecht 2009). The energy costs of acid-base regulation can exceed 10% of the total cell energy budget in these cases; however, the H<sup>+</sup> free energy difference across the plasmalemma of coccolithophores is much lower than in acidophilic algae, and it will be even lower at the projected 2100 surface ocean pH values.

An alternative potential energy cost of calcification with increasing external  $CO_2$  and assuming  $HCO_3^-$  entry involves a less strict homoeostatic regulation of cytosol pH (see Anning *et al.* 1996): if the cytosol pH more closely tracks external pH, then with a constant  $HCO_3^-$  accumulation ratio (cytosol:medium) the  $CO_3^{2-}$  concentration in the cytosol is lower than is the case for present day  $CO_2$ , with the consequence of an additional energy cost to achieving a  $CO_3^{2-}$  accumulation in the coccolith-forming vesicle that is sufficient to precipitate calcite.

For the less likely case of  $CO_3^{2-}$  entry, the lower external  $CO_3^{2-}$  concentration in a higher-CO<sub>2</sub> environment means that, to maintain a given CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> concentration in the cytosol, a CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> influx would be acting against a larger free energy difference and hence there would be a larger minimum energy input required to move a given amount of  $CO_3^{2-}$  into the cytosol. Alternatively, with a constant cytosol:medium concentration ratio for CO32-, and hence a lower CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> concentration in the cytosol under high CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, the minimum energy input for accumulation of CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> in the coccolith-forming vesicle would be greater. For CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> entry from the medium to the cytosol and uptake from the cytosol to the coccolith-forming vesicle, the flux of inorganic carbon through the cytosol would be largely as HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> (as is the case for HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> entry at the plasmalemma), again with the buffered H<sup>+</sup> flux through the cytosol from plasmalemma to coccolith-forming vesicle (see discussion above).

Once formed and externalised, coccoliths on living cells dissolve in surface seawater undersaturated with respect to the relevant (high-Mg or low-Mg) calcite form. The rate of dissolution is proportional to the degree of undersaturation. There is evidence consistent with a decreased dissolution rate as a result of the presence of a surface layer of organic matter (Iglesias-Rodriguez et al. 2008a): this layer is 280-350nm thick in dried specimens (Godoi et al. 2009). Diatoms show that organisms with short mean lifespans in nature (Marbà et al. 2007) can maintain an internally precipitated extracellular mineral (opaline silica) skeleton in a habitat that is always very significantly undersaturated with respect to the mineral. The rate of dissolution of the silica is decreased about 100-fold by the presence of the natural organic surface layer (Natori et al. 2006). In the present context, it is of interest that the rate of diatom silica dissolution is, by an unknown mechanism, a linear function of the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (Milligan et al. 2004). Of course, the differences in chemistry of calcite and opal mean that the apparent similarities of coccolithophore and diatom skeletal dissolution need further investigation.

#### CONCLUSIONS

Increased atmospheric  $CO_2$  is increasing the sea surface  $CO_2$  concentration, with a corresponding

smaller proportional increase in HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and a decrease in CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> and pH. These changes will, in isolation, either have no effect on the growth of non-calcified marine algae or will increase the growth rate. Inclusion of an indirect effect of increased CO<sub>2</sub>, i.e. shoaling of the upper mixed layer of the ocean as a consequence of warming, complicates the direct response to CO<sub>2</sub>. One outcome of this indirect effect is that CCMs are likely to be more persistent in a higher CO, world than would be expected from the effects on increased CO, alone. Many calcified red benthic algae and planktonic coccolithophores have decreased calcification and growth rate when grown at higher CO<sub>2</sub>, but some coccolithophores have an increased calcification and growth rate at higher CO, while others show an intermediate response. The decreased rate of the extracellular calcification of red algae at higher CO, relates to the decreased extracellular CO32- concentration, with interactions with photosynthesis. For the intracellular calcification of coccolithophores, examples where there is a decreased rate of calcification at higher CO<sub>2</sub> could be related to increased energy cost of H<sup>+</sup> extrusion if the cytosol pH is kept essentially constant, or a decreased concentration of  $CO_3^{2-}$  in the cytosol, if the cytosol pH more closely tracks external pH.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The University of Dundee is a registered Scottish Charity, No. SC015096. Discussions with John Beardall, Michael Borowitzka, Colin Brownlee, Katherine Crawfurd, Paul Falkowski, Richard Geider, Mario Giordano, Debora Iglesias-Rodriguez, Andrew Johnston, Ian Joint, Janet Kübler, Tony Larkum, Stephen Maberly, Bruce Osborne, Lynda Poole, Robert Riding and Glenn Wheeler have been very helpful. Bruce Osborne's editorial advice has been invaluable.

#### REFERENCES

- Adamczyk, K., Prement-Schwartz, M., Pines, D., Pines, E. and Nibbering, E.T.J. 2009 Realtime observations of carbonic acid formation in aqueous solution. *Science* **326**, 1690–4.
- Anning, K., Nimer, N.A., Merrett, M.J. and Brownlee, C. 1996 Costs and benefits of calcification in coccolithophorids. *Journal of Marine Systems* 9, 45–56.
- Balch, W.H., Holligan, P.H. and Kilpatrick, K.A. 1992 Calcification, photosynthesis and growth of the bloom-forming coccolithophore,

Emiliana huxleyi. Continental Shelf Research 12, 1353-74.

- Balch, W.H., Fritz, J. and Fernandez, E. 1996 Decoupling calcification and photosynthesis in the coccolithophore *Emiliania huxleyi* under steady-state light-limited growth. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 142, 87–97.
- Balch, W., Drapeau, D., Bowler, B. and Booth, E. 2007 Prediction of pelagic calcification rates using satellite measurements. *Deep-Sea Research Part II Current Topics in Oceanography* 54, 478–95.
- Barcelos e Ramos, J., Müller, M.N. and Riebesell, U. 2010 Short-term response of the coccolithophore *Emiliamia huxleyi* to an abrupt change in seawater CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. *Biogeoscience* 7, 177–86.
- Battarbee, R.K. 2010 Are our acidified upland waters are recovering? *Freshwater Biological* Association News 52, 4-5.
- Beard, D.A. and Qian, H. 2007 Relationship between thermodynamic driving force and one way fluxes in reversible processes. PLoS ONE 2, e144. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.000144
- Beman, A.M., Chow, C.E., King, A.L.K., Fend, Y., Fuhrman, J.A., Bates, N.R., Popp, B.N. and Hutchins, D.A. 2011 Global declines in oceanic nitrification rates as a consequence of ocean acidification. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science USA* 108, 208–13. doi:10.1073/ pnas.1011053108
- Berge, T., Daugbjerg, N., Andersen, B.B. and Hansen, P.J. 2010 Effect of lowered pH on marine phytoplankton. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 416, 79-91.
- Berner, E.K. and Berner, R.A. 1996 Water, air and geochemical cycles. Old Tappan, NJ, USA. Prentice Hall.
- Bethman, B. and Schönknecht, G. 2009 pH regulation in an acidophilic green alga – a quantitative analysis. New Phytologist 183, 327–39.
- Bierman, A. and Engel, A. 2010 The effect of  $CO_2$ on the properties and sinking velocity of aggregates of the coccolithophore *Emiliania huxleyi*. *Biogeosciences* **7**, 1017–29.
- Blake, C. and Maggs, C.A. 2003 Comparative growth rates and internal banding periodicity of maerl species (Corallinales, Rhodophyta) from Northern Europe. *Phycologia* 42, 606–12.
- Blinks, L.R. 1963 The effect of pH on the photosynthesis of littoral marine algae. Protoplasma 57, 126-36.
- Blunden, G., Campbell, S.A., Smith, J.R., Guiry, M.D., Hession, C.C. and Griffin, R.J. 1997 Chemical and physical characterization of calcified red algal deposits known as maerl. *Journal of Applied Phycology* 9, 11–7.
- Borowitzka, M.A. 1981 Photosynthesis and calcification in the articulated coralline red algae *Amphiroa anceps* and *A. foliacea. Marine Biology* **62**, 17-23.

- Bosence, D.W. 1976 Ecological studies on two unattached coralline algae from Western Ireland. *Palaeontology* 19, 365–95.
- Bosence, D. and Wilson, J. 2003 Maerl growth, carbonate production rates and accumulation rates in the northeast Atlantic. *Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems* **13**, S21–31.
- Boyce, D.G., Lewis, M.R. and Worm,B. 2010 Global productivity decline over the last century. *Nature* 466, 591-6.
- Breitbarth, E., Bellerby, R.J., Neill, C.C., Ardelan, M.V., Meyerhofer, M., Zollner, E., Croot, P.L. and Riebesell, U. 2010 Ocean acidification affects iron speciation during a coastal seawater mesocosm experiment. *Biogeosciences* 7, 1063-73.
- Broecker, W. and Clark, E. 2009 Ratio of coccolith CaCO<sub>3</sub> to foraminifera CaCO<sub>3</sub> in late Holocene deep sea sediments. *Paleoceanography* 24, PA3205.
- Buitenhuis, E.I., de Baar, H.J.W. and Veldhuis, M.J.W. 1999 Photosynthesis and calcification by *Emiliania huxleyi* (Prymnesiophyceae) as a function of inorganic carbon. *Journal of Phycology* 35, 949–59.
- Butterfield, N.J. 2000 Bangiomorpha pubescens n. gen., n. sp.: implications for the evolution of sex, multicelularity and the Mesoproterozic/ Neoproterozoic radiation of eukaryotes. Palaeobiology 26, 386-404.
- Chierichi, M. and Fransson, A. 2009 Calcium carbonate saturation in the surface water of the Arctic Ocean: undersaturation in freshwater influenced shelves. *Biogeosciences* 6, 2421–32.
- Chisholm, J.R.M. 2000 Calcification by crustose coralline algae on the Northern Great Barrier Reef, Australia. *Limnology and Oceanography* 45, 1476–84.
- Cuvellier, M.L., Allen, A.E., Maren, A., McCrow, J.P., Messié, M., Tringe, S.G., Woyke, T., Welsh, R.M., Ishoey, T., Less, J-H., Binder, B.J., Dupont, C.L., Latasa, M., Guigard, C., Back, K.C., Dupont, C.L., Latasa, M., Caleo, E., Read, B., Lasken, R.S., Chavez, F.P. and Worden, A.T. 2010 Targeted metagenomics and ecology of globally important uncultured eukaryotic phytoplankton. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* 107, 14679–84.
- Davis, K.J., Dove, P.H. and De Yoreo, J.J. 2000 The role of magnesium as an impurity in calcite growth. *Science* 290, 1134-7.
- DEFRA 2005 Ammonia in the UK. Available at http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/quality/ air/airquality/publications/ammonia/documents/ammonia-in-uk.pdf (accessed 18 March 2011).
- De Grave, S. and Whitaker, A. 1999 A census of maerl beds in Irish waters. *Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems* 9, 303-11.
- Doney, S.C., Mahowald, N., Lima, I., Feely, R.A., Mackenzie, F.T., Lamarque, J.-F. and Rasch,

P.J. 2007 Impact of anthrogenic atmospheric nitrogen and sulphur deposition in ocean acidification and the inorganic carbon system. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* **104**, 14580–5.

- Doney, S.C., Fabry, V.J., Feeley, R.A. and Kleypas, J.A. 2009 Ocean acidification: the other CO<sub>2</sub> problem. Annual Review of Marine Science 1, 169-92.
- Dore, J.E., Lukas, R., Sadler, D.W., Church, M.J. and Karl, D.M. 2009 Physical and biogeochemical modulation of ocean acidification in the central North Pacific. *Proceedings of the National Academy* of Sciences USA 106, 12235–40.
- Dupont, S., Dorey, N. and Thorndyke, M. 2010 What meta-analyses tell us about the vulnerability of marine biodiversity to ocean acidification. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 89, 182-5.
- Engel, A., Szlosek, J., Abrahamson, L., Liu, Z.F. and Lee, C. 2009a Investigating the effect of ballasting by CaCO<sub>3</sub> in *Emiliania huxleyi*: I. Formation, settling velocities and physical properties of the aggregates. *Deep-Sea Research Part II Topical Studies in Oceanography* 56, 1396–1407.
- Engel, A., Abrahamson, L., Szlosek, J., Liu, Z.F., Stewart, G., Hirschberg, D. and Lee, C. 2009b Investigating the effect of ballasting by CaCO<sub>3</sub> in *Emiliania huxleyi*: II. Decomposition of particulate organic matter. *Deep-Sea Research Part II – Topical Studies in Oceanography* 56, 1408–19.
- Fernández, E., Boyd, P., Holligan, P.M. and Harbour, D.S. 1993 Production of organic and inorganic carbon within large-scale coccolithophore bloom in the northeast Atlantic Ocean. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 97, 271–87.
- Fowler, D., Smith, R., Muller, J., Cape, J.N., Sutton, M., Erisman, J.W. and Fagerli, H. 2007 Long term trends in sulphur and nitrogen deposition in Europe and the cause of non-linearities. *Water, Air and Soil Pollution Focus* 7, 41–7.
- Francis, St.P., Bunker, D., Brodie, J.A., Maggs, C.A. and Bunker, A.R. 2010 Seasearch guide to the seaweeds of Britain and Ireland. Ross-on-Wye, UK. Marine Conservation Society.
- Gao, K., Aruga, Y., Asada, K., Ishihara, T., Akaro, T. and Kiyahara, M. 1993 Calcification in the articulated coralline alga *Corallina pilulifera*, with special reference to the effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Marine Biology* 117, 129–32.
- Garrels, R.M. and Lerman, A. 1981 Phanerozoic cycles of sedimentary carbon and sulphur. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the* USA **78**, 4652–6.
- Gattuso, J.-P., Frankignoule, M. and Wollast, R. 1998 Carbon and carbonate metabolism in coastal aquatic ecosystems. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 29, 405-34.

- Giordano, M., Beardall, J. and Raven, J.A. 2005 CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanisms in algae: mechanisms, environmental modulation and evolution. *Annual Review of Plant Biology* **56**, 99–131.
- Giordano, M., Norici, A., Ratti, S. and Raven, J.A. 2008 Role for sulphur for algae: acquisition, metabolism, ecology and evolution. In R. Hell, C. Dahl, D. Knaff and T. Leustek (eds), Sulphur metabolism in phototrophic organisms, 405–23. Dordrecht. Springer,
- Godoi, R.H.H., Aerts, K., Harley, J., Kaegi, R., Ro, C-U., Chou, L. and Van Grieken, R. 2009 Organic surface coating on coccolithophores – *Emiliania huxleyi*: its determination and implication in the marine carbon cycle. *Microchemical Journal* 91, 593-6.
- Goldman, J.C. and Brewer, P.G. 1980 Effect of nitrogen source and growth rate on phytoplankton-linked changes in alkalinity. *Limnology and* Oceanography 25, 352-7.
- Gravot, A., Dittami, S.M., Rousvoal, I.S., Lugier, R., Eggert, A., Collen, J., Boyen, C., Bouchereau, A. and Tonon, C. 2010 Diurnal oscillations of metabolite abundance and gene analysis provide new insights into central metabolic processes of the brown alga *Ectocarpus siliculosus*. New Phytologist 188, 98–110.
- Green, J.C. and Leadbeater, B.S.C. (eds) 1994 The haptophyte algae. Systematics Association Special Volume no. 51. Oxford. Oxford University Press.
- Guan, W.C. and Gao, K.S. 2010a Impacts of UV radiation on photosynthesis and growth of the coccolithophore *Emiliania huxleyi* (Haptophyceae). *Environmental and Experimental Botany* **67**, 502–8.
- Guan, W.C. and Gao, K.S. 2010b Enhanced calcification ameliorates the negative effects of UV radiation on photosynthesis in the calcifying phytoplankter *Emiliania huxleyi*. Chinese Science Bulletin 55, 588–93.
- Gurevitch, J. and Hedges, L.V. 1999 Statistical issues in ecological meta-analyses. *Ecology* 80, 1142-9.
- Hall-Spencer, J.M., Rodolfo-Metalpa, R., Martin, S., Ransone, E., Fine, M., Turner, S.M., Rowley, S.J., Tedesco, D. and Buia, M.-C. 2008 Volcanic carbon dioxide vents show ecosystem effects of ocean acidification. *Nature* 354, 96–9.
- Harris, R.P. 1994 Zooplankton grazing on the coccolithophore *Emiliania huxleyi* and its role in inorganic carbon flux. *Marine Biology* **119**, 431–9.
- Harris, G.N., Scanlan, D.J. and Geider, R.J. 2005 Acclimation of *Emiliania huxleyi* (Prymnesiophyceae) to photon flux density. *Journal of Phycology* 41, 851–62.
- Hedges, L.V., Gurevitch, J. and Curtis, P.S. 1999 The meta-analysis of response ratios in experimental ecology. *Ecology* **80**, 1150–6.
- Hendriks, I.E. and Duarte, C.M. 2010 Ocean acidification: separating evidence from judgement – a

reply to Dupont et al. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science 89, 186–94.

- Hendriks, I.E., Duarte, C.M. and Álvarez, M. 2010 Vulnerability of marine biodiversity to ocean acidification: a meta-analysis. *Estuarine*, *Coastal and Shelf Science* 86, 157–64.
- Herfort, L., Loste, E., Meldrum, F. and Thake, B. 2004 Structural and physiological effects of calcium and magnesium in *Emiliania huxleyi* (Lohman) Hay and Mohler. Journal of Structural Biology 148, 307–14.
- Ho, T.-Y., Quigg, A., Finkel, Z.V., Milligan, A.J., Wyman, K., Falkowski, P.G. and Morel, F.M.M. 2003 The elemental composition of some marine phytoplankton. *Journal of Phycology* 39, 1145-59.
- Hofmann, G.E., Barry, J.P., Edmunds, P.J., Gates, R.D., Hutchins, D.A., Klinger, T. and Sewell, M.A. 2010 The effects of ocean acidification on calcifying organisms in marine ecosystems: an organism-to-ecosystem perspective. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution and Systematics 41, 127-47.
- Hurd, C.L., Hepburn, C.D., Currie, K.I., Raven, J.A. and Hunter, K.A. 2009 Testing the effects of ocean acidification on algal metabolism: considerations for experimental design. *Journal of Phycology* 45, 1030-51. doi:10.1111/j.1529.8817.2009. 00768.x
- Hutton, J. 1795 Theory of the Earth, with proofs and illustrations, Volumes I and II. Edinburgh. Creech.
- Hutton, J. 1889 Theory of the Earth, with proofs and illustrations, Volume III. Edited by Sir Archibald Geikie. London. Geological Society, Burlington House.
- Hyde, P.B., Carton, O.T., O'Toole, P. and Musselbrook, T.H. 2003 A new inventory of ammonia emissions from Irish agriculture. Atmospheric Environment 37, 55-62.
- Iglesias-Rodriguez, M.D., Halloran, P.R., Rickaby, R.E.M., Hall, I.R., Colmenero-Hidalgo, E., Gittins, J.R., Green, D.R.M., Tyrrell, T., Gibbs, S.J., von Passow, P., Rehm, E., Armbrust, E.V. and Boessenkoot, K.P. 2008a Phytoplankton calcification in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> world. *Science* **320**, 336-40.
- Iglesias-Rodriguez, M.D., Buitenhuis, E.J., Raven, J.A., Schofield, O., Poulton, A.J., Gibbs, M., Halloran, P.R. and de Baar, H.J.W. 2008b Comment on response to "Phytoplankton calcification in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> world". *Science* 322, 1466.
- Irie, T., Bessho, K., Findlay, H.S. and Calosi, P. 2010 Increasing costs due to ocean acidification drives phytoplankton to be more heavily calcified: optimal growth strategy of coccolithophores. PLoS ONE 5 (10), e13436.
- Irvine, L.M. and Chamberlain, Y.M. 1994 Seaweeds of the British Isles. Volume I Rhodophyta. Part 2B Corallinales, Hildenbrandiales. London: Natural History Museum.

- Jardiller, L., Zubkov, M.V., Pearman, J. and Scanlan, D.J. 2010 Significant CO<sub>2</sub> fixation by small Prymnesiophyceae in the subtropical and tropical Northeast Atlantic Ocean. *ISME Journal* 4, 1180–92.
- Johnston, A.M., Maberly, S.C. and Raven, J.A. 1992 The acquisition of inorganic carbon by four red macroalgae from different habitats. *Oecologia* **92**, 317–26.
- Jones, M.R., Leith, I.D., Fowler, D., Raven, J.A., Sutton, M.A., Nemiz, E., Cape, J.N., Sheppard, L.J., Smith, R.I. and Theobald, M.R. 2007a Concentration-dependent NH<sub>3</sub> deposition processes for mixed moorland seminatural vegetation. Atmospheric Environment 41, 2049-60.
- Jones, M.R., Leith, I.D., Fowler, D., Raven, J.A., Sutton, M.A., Nemiz, E., Cape, J.N., Sheppard, L.J. and Smith, R.I. 2007b Concentrationdependent NH<sub>3</sub> deposition processes for stomatal and non-stomatal moorland species. *Atmospheric Environment* 41, 8980–94.
- Katchalsky, A.K. and Curran, P.F. 1965 Non-equilibrium thermodynamics in biophsics. Cambridge, Mass, USA: Harvward University Press.
- Kevekordes, K., Holland, D., Häubner, N., Jenkins, S., Kos, R., Roberts, S., Raven, J.A., Scrimgeour, C.M., Shelly, K., Stojkovic, S. and Beardall, J. 2006 Inorganic carbon acquisition by eight species of *Caulerpa* (Caulerpaceae, Chlorophyta). *Phycologia* 45, 442–9.
- Kroeker, K.J., Kordas, R.L., Crim, R.N. and Singh, G.G. 2010 Meta-analysis reveals negative yet variable effects of ocean acidification on marine organisms. *Ecology Letters* 13, 1419–34.
- Kübler, J.E., Johnston, A.M. and Raven,
   J.A. 1999 The effects of reduced and elevated
   CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> on the seaweed, Lomentaria articulata.
   Plant, Cell and Environment 22, 1303-10.
- Kuffner, I.B., Andersson, A.J., Jokiel, P.L., Rodgers, K.S. and Mackenzie, F.T. 2008 Decreased abundance of crustose coralline algae due to ocean acidification. *Nature Geosciences* 1, 114-7.
- Langer, G., Geisen, M., Baumann, K.H., Klas, J., Riebesell, U., Thoms, S. and Young, J.R. 2006 Species-specific responses of calcifying algae to changing seawater carbonate chemistry. Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems 7, art. no. Q09006.
- Langer, G., Nehrke, G., Probert, J., Ly, J. and Ziveri, P. 2009 Strain-specific response of *Emiliania* huxleyi to changing seawater carbonate chemistry. Biogeosciences 6, 2637–46.
- Langner, U., Jakob, T., Shehfest, K. and Wilhelm, C. 2008 An energy balance from absorbed photons to new biomass for *Chlamydomonas rein*hardtii and *Chlamydomonas acidophila* under neutral and extremely acid growth conditions. *Plant, Cell* and Environment **32**, 250–8.

- Leonardos, N., Read, B., Thake, B. and Young, J.R. 2009 No mechanistic dependence of photosynthesis on calcification in *Emiliania huxleyi* (Haptophyta). *Journal of Phycology* **45**, 1046–51.
- Littler, M.M., Littler, D.S. and Hanisak, M.D. 1991 Deep-water rhodolith distribution, productivity, and growth history at sites of formation and subsequent degradation. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 150, 163-82.
- Littler, M.M., Littler, D.S., Blair, S.M. and Norris, J.N. 1985 Deepest known plant life discovered on an uncharted seamount. *Science* 227, 57–9.
- Liu, H., Probert, I., Uitz, J., Claustre, H., Aris-Broseau, S., Froda, M., Not, F. and de Vargas, C. 2009 Haptophytes rule the waves: extreme oceanic biodiversity in non-calcifying prymnesiophytes explains the 19-Hex paradox. *Proceedings* of the National Academy of Sciences USA 106, 12803-8. doi: 10.1073/pnas/0905841106.
- Luther, H. 1947 Vorschlag zu einer ökologische Grundeinteilung der Hydrophyten. Acta Botanica Fennica 44, 1–15.
- Maberly, S.C. 1990 Exogenous inorganic carbon sources for photosynthesis by marine macroalgae. *Journal of Phycology* 26, 434–41.
- Maberly, S.C. 1992 Carbonate ions appear to neither inhibit nor stimulate the use of bicarbonate ions in photosynthesis by Ulva lactuca. Plant, Cell and Environment 15, 255-60.
- Maberly, S.C. 1996 Diel, episodic and seasonal changes in pH and concentrations of inorganic carbon in a productive lake. *Freshwater Biology* **38**, 579–98.
- Maberly, S.C., Raven, J.A. and Johnston, A.M. 1992 Discrimination between <sup>12</sup>C and <sup>13</sup>C by marine plants. *Oecologia* **91**, 481–92.
- Mackinder, L., Wheeler, G., Schroeder, D., Riebesell, U. and Brownlee, C. 2010 Molecular mechanisms underlying calcification in cocccolithophores. *Geomicrobiology Journal* 27, 583–95.
- Mantone, P.T. 2010 Quantifying growth and calcium carbonate deposition in *Calliarthron cheilosporoides* (Corallinales, Rhodophyta) in the field using a persistent vital stain. *Journal of Phycology* **46**, 13-7.
- Marbà, N., Duarte, C.M. and Agusti, S. 2007 Allometric scaling of plant life history. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA 104, 15777–80. doi: 10.1073/pnas.0703476104.
- Messerli, M.A., Amaral-Zettler, L.A., Zettler, E., Jung, S.-K., Smith, P.J.S. and Sogin, M.L. 2005 Life at acidic pH imposes an increased energetic cost for a eukaryotic acidophile. *Journal of Experimental Biology* **208**, 2569–79.
- Middelboe, A.L. and Hansen, P.J. 2007 High pH in shallow water macroalgal habitats. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 338, 107–17.
- Milligan, A.J., Varela, D.E., Brzezinski, M.A. and Morel, F.M.M. 2004 Dynamics of silicon

metabolism and silicon isotope discrimination in a marine diatom as a function of  $pCO_2$ . Limnology and Oceanography **49**, 322–9.

- Müller, M.N., Schulz, K.G. and Riebesell, U. 2010 Effects of long-term high CO<sub>2</sub> exposure on two species of cocolithophores. *Biogeosciences* 7, 1109–16.
- Natori, Y., Haned, A. and Suzuki, Y. 2006 Vertical and seasonal differences in biogenic silica dissolution in natural seawater in Suruga Bay, Japan: effects of temperature and organic matter. *Marine Chemistry* **102**, 230–41.
- Neilsen, L.T., Jakobsen, H.H., and Hansen, P.J. 2010 High resilience of two coastal plankton communities to twenty-first century seawater acidification: evidence from microcosm studies. *Marine Biology Research* 6, 542–55.
- Nobel, P.S. 2005 *Physicochemical and environmental plant physiology.* 3rd edn. Burlingtom, MA, USA. Academic Elsevier.
- O'Boyle, S. and Silke, J. 2010 A review of phytoplankton ecology in estuarine and coastal waters around Ireland. *Journal of Plankton Research* 32, 99-118.
- Odum, H.T. and Pinkerton, R.C. 1955 Time's speed regulator: the optimum efficiency for maximum power output in physical and biological systems. *American Scientist* 43, 331– 43.
- Paasche, E. 1964 A tracer study of the inorganic carbon uptake during coccolith formation and photosynthesis in the coccolithophid Coccolithus huxleyi (Prymnesiophycea). Physiologia Plantarum 3 (supplement), 5–82.
- Paasche, E. 1965 The effect of 3-(p-chlorophenyl)-1,1-dimethylurea on photosynthesis and light-dependent coccolith formation in *Coccolithus huxleyi*. *Physiologia Plantarum* 18, 138-45.
- Paasche, E. 1996a Adjustment to light and dark rates of coccolith formation. *Physiologia Plantarum* 19, 271–8.
- Paasche, E. 1996b Action spectrum of coccolith formation. *Physiologia Plantarum* 19, 770–9.
- Paasche, E. 2001 A review of the coccolithophorid *Emiliania huxleyi* (Prymnesiophyceae) with particular reference to growth, coccolith formation and calcification-photosynthesis interactions. *Phycologia* 40, 503–29.
- Paerl, H.W. 1997 Coastal eutrophication and harmful algal blooms: importance of atmospheric deposition and groundwater as "new" nitrogen and other nutrient sources. *Limnology and Oceanography* 42, 1154–65.
- Poole, L.J. and Raven, J.A. 1997 The biology of Enteromorpha. Progress in Phycological Research 12, 1-148.
- Poulton, A.J., Adey, T.R., Balch, W.M. and Holligan, P.M. 2007 Relating coccolithophore calcification to phytoplankton community dynamics: Regional differences and implications for carbon

export. Deep-Sea Research Part II Current Topics in Oceanography **54**, 538–57.

- Raven, J.A. 1976 Transport in algal cells. In U. Lüttge and M.G. Pitman (eds), *Transport in cells and tissues*, 129–188. Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology, New Series vol. 2. Berlin. Springer-Verlag.
- Raven, J.A. 1980 Nutrient transport in microalgae. Advances in Microbial Physiology 21, 47-226.
- Raven, J.A. 1993 Carbon: a phycocentric view. In G.T. Evans and M.J.R. Fasham (eds), *Towards a* model of ocean biogeochemical processes. NATO. ASI Series, Series I, Global Environmental Change vol. 10, 123–52. Berlin. Springer Verlag.
- Raven, J.A. 2010 Inorganic carbon acquisition by eukaryotic algae: four current questions. *Photosynthesis Research* **106**, 123–34. doi: 10.1007/ s11120-010-9563-7
- Raven, J.A. 2011 Carbon. In B. Whitton (ed.), *Ecology of cyanobacteria*, 2nd edn. Berlin. Springer. In press.
- Raven, J.A. and Cockell, C.S. 2006 Influence on photosynthesis of starlight, moonlight, planetlight and light pollution (reflections on photosynthetically active radiation in the universe). *Astrobiology* 6, 668–75.
- Raven, J.A. and Farquhar, G.D. 1990 The influence of N metabolism and organic acid synthesis on the natural abundance of C isotopes in plants. *New Phytologist* **116**, 505–29.
- Raven, J.A. and Johnston, A.M. 1991 Photosynthetic carbon assimilation by *Prasiola stipitata* (Prasiolales, Chlorophyta) under emersed and submersed conditions: relationship to the taxonomy of *Prasiola. British Phycological Journal* 26, 247–57.
- Raven, J.A. and Smith, F.A. 1974 Significance of hydrogen ion transport in plant cells. *Canadian Journal of Botany* 52, 1035–48.
- Raven, J.A. and Smith, F.A. 1976 Nitrogen assimilation and transport in vascular land plants in relation to intracellular pH regulation. New Phytologist 76, 415–31.
- Raven, J.A. and Smith, F.A. 1980 Intracellular pH regulation in the giant-celled marine alga Chaetomorpha darwinii. Journal of Experimental Botany 31, 1357-71.
- Raven, J.A. and Waite, A. 2004 Tansley Review: The evolution of silicification in diatoms: inescapable sinking and sinking as escape? *New Phytologist* 162, 45-61.
- Raven, J.A., Ball, L.A., Beardall, J., Giordano, M. and Maberly, S.C. 2005 Algae lacking carbon concentrating mechanisms. *Canadian Journal of Botany* 83, 879–90.
- Raven, J.A., Beardall, J., Giordano, M. and Maberly, S.C. 2011 Algal and aquatic plant carbon concentrating mechanisms in relation to environmental change. *Photosynthesis Research*, in press. doi: 10.1007/s11120-011-9632-6.
- Raven, J.A., Caldeira, K., Enderfield, H., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Liss, P., Riebesell, U., Shepherd,

J., Turley, C., Watson, A., Heap, R., Banes, R. and Quinn, R. 2005 Ocean acidification due to increasing carbon dioxide. The Royal Society of London report 12/05.

- Raven, J.A., Johnston, A.M., Kübler, J.E., Korb, R.E., McInroy, S.G., Handley, L.L., Scrimgeour, C.M., Walker, D.I., Beardall, J., Vanderklift, M., Fredricksen, J. and Dunton, K.H. 2002a Mechanistic interpretation of carbon isotope discrimination by marine macroalgae and seagrasses. *Functional Plant Biology* 29, 355-78.
- Raven, J.A., Johnston, A.M., Kübler, J.E., Korb,
  R.E., McInroy, S.G., Handley, L.L., Scrimgeour,
  C.M., Walker, D.I., Beardall, J., Clayton, M.N.,
  Vanderklift, M., Fredriksen, S. and Dunton,
  K.H. 2002b Seaweeds in cold seas: evolution and carbon acquisition. *Annals of Botany* 90, 525–36.
- Raven, J.A., Kübler, J.I. and Beardall, J. 2000 Put out the light, and then put out the light. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom 80, 1–25.
- Reinfelder, J.R. 2011 Carbon concentrating mechanisms in eukaryotic marine phytoplankton. *Annual Review of Marine Sciences* **3**, 291–315.
- Ridgwell, A., Schmidt, D.N., Turley, C., Brownlee, C., Maldonado, M.T., Tortell, P. and Young, J.R. 2009 From laboratory manipulations to Earth System models. Scaling calcification impacts on ocean acidification. *Biogeosciences* 6, 2611-23.
- Riebesell, U., Bellerby, R.G.J., Engel, A., Fabry,
  V.J., Hutchins, D.A., Reusch, T.B.H., Schulz,
  K.G. and Morel, F.M.M. 2008 Comment
  on "Phytoplankton calcification in a high-CO<sub>2</sub>
  world". Science 322, 1466. doi: 10.1126/
  science.1161096
- Riebesell, U., Fabry, V.J., Nansson, L.N. and Gattuso, J.-P (eds) 2010 Guide to best practices for ocean acidification research and data reporting. 260 pp. Luxembourg. Publications Office of the European Union. http://www.epoca-project.eu/index.php/ guide-to-best-practices-for-ocean-acidificationresearch-and-data-reporting.html (accessed 18 March 2011).
- Ries, J.B. 2006 High Mg calcite in crustose coralline algae: geochemical, biological and sedimentological implications of secular variations in the Mg/Ca ratio of seawater. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 70, 891–900.
- Ries, J.B., Cohen, A.L. and McCorkle, D.C. 2009 Marine calcifiers exhibit mixed response to CO<sub>2</sub>-induced ocean acidification. *Geology* 37, 1131-4.
- Schulz, K.G., Ramos, J.B.E., Zeebe, R.E. and Riebesell, U. 2009 CO<sub>2</sub> perturbation experiments: similarities and differences between dissolved inorganic carbon and total alkalinity manipulations. *Biogeosciences* 6, 2145–53.

- Semesi, I.S., Kangira, J. and Bjork, M. 2009 Alteration in seawater pH and CO<sub>2</sub> affect calcification and photosynthesis in tropical coralline alga, Hydrolithon sp. Rhodophyta. Estuarine, Coastal and Marine Science 84, 337-41.
- Shi, D., Xu, Y. and Morel, F.M.M. 2009 Effects of the  $pH/pCO_2$  control method on medium chemistry and phytoplankton growth. *Biogeosciences* **6**, 1199–207.
- Shi, D., Hopkinson, B.M. and Morel, F.M.M. 2010 Effect of ocean acidification in iron availability to marine phytoplankton. *Science* 327, 676–9. doi: 10.1126/science.1183517
- Sikes, C.S. and Wilbur, K.M. 1982 Function of coccoliths. *Limnology and Oceanography* 27, 18-26.
- Sikes, C.S., Roer, R.D. and Wilbur, K.M. 1980 Photosynthesis and coccolith formation: inorganic carbon sources and net reaction of deposition. *Limnology and Oceanography* **25**, 248–61.
- Small, J. 1946 pH and Plants. London. Baillière, Tyndall and Cox.
- Small, J. 1954 Modern aspects of pH (with special reference to soil and plants. London. Baillière, Tyndall and Cox.
- Small, J. 1955 The pH of plant cells. In L.V. Heilbrunn and F. Weber (eds), *Protoplasmatologia*, 1–116. Cytoplasma, Band II B2C. Vienna. Springer-Verlag.
- Smith, F.A. and Raven, J.A. 1979 Intracellular pH and its regulation. Annual Review of Plant Physiology 30, 289–311.
- Stanley, S.M., Ries, J.B. and Hardie, L.A. 2002 Low-magnesium calcite produced by coralline algae in seawater of Late Cretaceous composition. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* 99, 15323-6.
- Stanley, S.M., Ries, J.B. and Hardie, L.A. 2005 Seawater chemistry, coccolithophore population growth, and the origin of Cretaceous chalk. *Geology* 33, 593-6.
- Steinacher, M., Joos, F., Frolicher, T.L., Bopp, L., Cadule, P., Cocco, V., Doney, S.C., Gehlen, M., Lindsay, K., Moore, J.K., Schneider, B. and Segschneider, J. 2010 Projected 21<sup>st</sup> century decrease in marine primary productivity: a multimodel analysis. *Biogeosciences* 7, 979–1005.
- Steneck, R.S. 1983 Escalating herbivory and resulting adaptive trends in calcareous algal crusts. *Palaeobiology* 9, 44–61.
- Steneck, R.S. 1986 The ecology of coralline algal crusts: converging patterns and adaptive strategies. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 17, 273-303.
- Suffrian, K., Schulz, K.G., Ricbesell, U. and McCorkle, D.C. 2011 Cellular pH measurements in *Emiliania huxleyi* reveal pronounced membrane proton permeability. *New Phytologist*, in press. doi: 10.1111/j.1469.8137.2010.03633.x

- Taylor, A.R., Chrachri, A., Wheeler, G.L., Goddard, H. and Brownlee, C. 2011 A proton channel underlies intracellular pH regulation in calcifying coccolithophores. *PLoS Biology*, in press.
- Thierstein, H.R. and Young, J.R. (eds) 2004 Coccolithophores: from molecular mechanisms to global impacts. Heidelberg and Berlin. Springer.
- Trimborn, S., Langer, G. and Rost, B. 2007 Effect of varying calcium concentrations and light intensities on calcification and photosynthesis in *Emiliania huxleyi. Limnology and Oceanography* 52, 2285–93.
- Tyrrell, T. 2011 Anthropogenic modification of the oceans. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London A* **369**, 887–908.
- Tyrrell, T. and Merico, A. 2004 Emiliania huxleyi: bloom observation and the conditions that induce them. In H.R. Thierstein and J.R. Young (eds), Coccolithophores: from molecular mechanisms to global impacts, 75–97. Heidelberg and Berlin. Springer.
- Uitz, H., Claustre, H., Gentoli, B. and Stramski, D. 2010 Phytoplankton class-specific primary production in the world's oceans; seasonal and interannual variability from satellite observations.

Global Biogeochemical Cycles 24 (3), GB 2016. doi: 10.1029/2009GB003680

- Walker, N.A. 1976 Membrane transport: theoretical background. In U. Lüttge and M.G. Pitman (eds), *Transport in cells and tissues*. Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology, New Series vol. 2, part B, 36-52. Berlin. Springer-Verlag.
- Wilson, S., Blake, C., Berges, J.A. and Maggs, C.A. 2004 Environmental tolerances of free-living coralline algae (maerl): implications for European marine conservation. *Biological Conservation* 120, 279–89.
- Yamamoto, M.Y., McLaughlin, F.A., Carmack, E.C., Nishino, S. and Shimada, K. 2009 Aragonite undersaturation in the Arctic Ocean: effects of ocean acidification and sea ice melt. *Science* 326, 1098–100.
- Young, J.R. 1994 Functions of coccoliths. In A. Winter and W.G. Siesser (eds), *Coccolithophores*, 63-83. Cambridge, UK. Cambridge University Press.
- Zeebe, R.E. and Wolf-Gladrow, D. 2001 CO<sub>2</sub> in seawater: equilibrium, kinetics, isotopes. Elsevier Oceanography Series Volume 65. Amsterdam. Elsevier.